CALL TO ORDER 5:00 P.M.

The Regular Meeting of the City Council of the City of Dana Point, California, was called to order by Mayor Bishop at 5:00 p.m. in the Dana Point City Council Chamber, 33282 Golden Lantern, Suite 210, Dana Point.

# **ROLL CALL OF CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS:**

Joel Bishop, Mayor Lisa A. Bartlett, Mayor Pro Tem Lara Anderson, Council Member Diane L. Harkey, Council Member (arrived at 5:05 p.m.) Steven H. Weinberg, Council Member

STAFF PRESENT: Douglas Chotkevys, City Manager; Patrick Muñoz, City Attorney; Kathy Ward, City Clerk; Michael Killebrew, Administrative Services Director; Kyle Butterwick, Director of Community Development; Brad Fowler, Director of Public Works/City Engineer; Matthew Sinacori, City Engineer; Lt. Mark Levy, Chief of Police; Mike Rose, Emergency & Support Services Manager; Kevin Evans, Director of Community Services & Parks; Bobbi Ogan, Deputy City Clerk; Windy Robles, City Clerk Specialist; Lynn Kelly, Management Analyst; Christy Teague, Economic Development Manager; DyAnne Weamire, Administrative Secretary; and Jackie Littler, Executive Secretary.

#### **CLOSED SESSION**

City Attorney Muñoz indicated there was a need for a Closed Session as follows:

- A. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL ANTICIPATED LITIGATION, SIGNIFICANT EXPOSURE TO LITIGATION, Government Code § 54956.9 (b)(1) & (3)(A), (1 case)
- B. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL ANTICIPATED LITIGATION, SIGNIFICANT EXPOSURE TO LITIGATION, Government Code § 54956.9 (b)(1), (2 cases: Makar General Plan Amendment; Evans Brown Act Allegations)

Mayor Bishop recessed the meeting into a Closed Session at 5:01 p.m. pursuant to Government Code Section 54956 *et. seq.* 

#### RECONVENE CITY COUNCIL MEETING

Mayor Bishop reconvened the meeting at 6:00 p.m. All Council Members were present.

#### **CLOSED SESSION ANNOUNCEMENT**

City Attorney Muñoz stated that there was no announcement.

#### PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Lou Penrose, District Director for Congressman John Campbell's Office.

## **INVOCATION**

The Invocation was provided by Father Steve Sallot of St. Edwards Catholic Church.

#### PRESENTATIONS AND PROCLAMATIONS

## Business of the Month – Royal Cleaners:

Management Analyst Kelly provided a PowerPoint presentation. She reported the Park's took ownership of the cleaners in July of 2006. They provide cleaning services for items such as leather, wedding gowns, rugs, suede, and drapes. Royal Cleaners also offers same day service, alterations, and they have a hanger recycling program. Mayor Bishop presented a Certificate of Recognition to Chang Park, owner, for being named the Business of the Month.

# Certificates of Recognition for OCSD Medal of Valor Recipients

The City Council attended the Orange County Sheriff's Department Medal of Valor Award Ceremony on March 21<sup>st</sup>. The City of Dana Point is proud to have several recipients from the Dana Point Police Services that were honored. The honorees were awarded Medals of Honor for Lifesaving and Courage. Mayor Bishop called Acting Sheriff Jack Anderson up to the podium along with Captain Ron White, and Lieutenant Mark Levy. Lt. Levy along with Mayor Bishop presented Certificates of Recognition to Sergeant John Carpenter, Deputy Brett Gardner, Deputy Christopher Ledbetter, and Deputy Frank Smith for receiving the Medal of Honor for Courage for entering a burning apartment in February of 2007. Lt Levy along with Mayor Bishop presented a Certificate of Recognition to Deputy Craig Nelson for receiving the Medal of Honor for Lifesaving when in January of 2007 he responded to the home of a young woman who was unresponsive.

#### Proclamation for OCFA Battalion Chief Steve Whitaker

Mayor Bishop presented a Proclamation to Battalion Chief Steve Whitaker. Battalion Chief Whitaker will be transferring to the City of Rancho Santa Margarita.

# **CONSENT CALENDAR**

Staff removed Item No. 12 and Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett removed Item No. 9 from the Consent Calendar.

IT WAS MOVED BY COUNCIL MEMBER ANDERSON, SECONDED BY MAYOR PRO TEM BARTLETT, THAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS BE ACCEPTED FOR ALL ITEMS LISTED ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR WITH THE EXCEPTION OF ITEM NO. 9 AND ITEM NO. 12.

The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES: Council Members Anderson, Harkey, Weinberg, Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett and

Mayor Bishop

NOES: None ABSENT: None

#### 1. WAIVE THE READING OF ORDINANCES AND APPROVE READING BY TITLE ONLY

APPROVED THE READING BY TITLE ONLY OF ALL ORDINANCES ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR AND THAT FURTHER READING OF SUCH ORDINANCES BE WAIVED.

#### 2. REGULAR MEETING MINUTES, APRIL 15, 2008

APPROVED THE MINUTES.

## 3. PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES, APRIL 8, 2008

RECEIVED AND FILED.

## 4. PLANNING COMMISSION ACTIONS, MEETING OF APRIL 22, 2008

RECEIVED AND FILED.

#### 5. MEETING CALENDAR / COMMUNITY SPECIAL EVENTS CALENDAR

RECEIVED AND FILED.

#### 6. TRAFFIC IMPROVEMENT COMMISSION MINUTES, MARCH 19, 2008

RECEIVED AND FILED.

#### 7. CITY TREASURER'S REPORT, MARCH 2008

RECEIVED AND FILED THE CITY TREASURER'S REPORT FOR THE MONTH OF MARCH.

#### 8. CLAIMS AND DEMANDS

RECEIVED AND FILED THE CLAIMS AND DEMANDS.

# 9. EIGHTH AMENDMENT TO EMPLOYMENT AGREEMENT FOR CITY MANAGER DOUGLAS C. CHOTKEVYS

Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett removed this item from the Consent Calendar.

City Attorney Muñoz provided a staff report.

Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett stated that after reviewing the agreement, she gave it some additional thought based on the economy at present. The City Manager position is an Executive Management position. It is an at-will type of agreement and to continue with the level of transparency that the Council indicated that it would do, she would like to discuss it a little further and then possibly propose a different motion than the recommended action. She would like to have the Council agree upon a percentage increase for the City Manager along with an incentive based performance bonus.

Mayor Bishop stated that there are three different ways to compensate a General Manager. One would be an annual raise, a bonus, and or a hybrid of the two. He said that members of the Council felt that the incentive of a bonus is something that they would like to look at this year. He said what did not work about the bonus was that it does not add to the retirement level. He felt they should use the base pay and then use the Consumer Price Index (CPI) to keep the City Manager in parody with inflation and then there is still the benefit of the bonus incentive. The bonus would be given after certain goals and objectives have been met.

Council Member Anderson stated that traditionally the Council has provided a percentage increase without any bonuses. She said that she is open to the idea of a bonus, but she is not a fan of it. She feels that someone should be doing their job for the sake of doing their job, not looking for a bonus. She stated that City Manager Chotkevys has done an excellent job and a scheduled compensation is fair rather then receiving a bonus based on arbitrary goals that have to be created every year in a performance evaluation. She stated that she would like to do the traditional percentage increase and do away with the bonus.

Council Member Harkey stated that she had brought up the idea of a bonus last year because the base was continually increasing. She felt that for the beach cities, the City Manager is on par with his salary. She felt that this year there is a problem because a CPI adjusted salary increase is something that most people in the private sector do not have. They receive a salary increase if they are lucky and right now a lot of people are being laid off as well as in the public sector. She felt that the City has to be very careful in what is done in personnel this year. She stated that there seems to be a possibility for a 13% pay increase as proposed. She felt that there should be a bonus in-lieu of an increase because to constantly up the base was not a great idea. She stated that she never wanted to support both of them so if they could pick one, she would be happy with that. She stated that she would support up to a 10% bonus and no increase or a straight percentage for an increase.

Council Member Anderson asked City Attorney Muñoz what the percentage would be to keep City Manager Chotkevys at the median level.

City Attorney Muñoz asked Director of Administrative Services Killebrew to assist him in finding that percentage.

Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett stated that she did not know of any other city that offers a cost of living increase for the City Manager.

Council Member Harkey stated that a CPI is unique and generally something a union employee would have in their contract.

Council Member Weinberg reported that a cost of living increase plus a bonus are given in the private sector. He stated that the City Manager is their employee and they ought to give him measurable attributes and if he meets those attributes, he should receive a bonus. He feels that it is worth trying for a couple of years to see how it works. He added that the CPI is 3 ½ - 4% this year.

Mayor Bishop stated that he and Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett came up with goals and objectives. They did provide the City Manager with an annual review and the contract was the outcome of that review.

Council Member Anderson stated that she was waiting for some results before she makes a motion.

A motion was made by Council Member Weinberg for Item No. 9 as presented and seconded by Mayor Bishop.

There was no vote and discussion continued.

Council Member Anderson said that she would like to make another motion but she is waiting on information from staff.

Council Member Harkey stated that she had worked in business and that her position had a fixed base salary with a bonus incentive program. She said that in many industries the CPI adjustment is a performance evaluation increase. She feels that in this economy a potential 13% increase is not right regardless of how well the City is doing.

Mayor Bishop stated that no one was proposing a 13% increase.

Council Member Harkey replied that the document states a CPI and up to a 10% bonus.

City Attorney Muñoz stated that the median salary would be \$206,532 and that would require a 9% increase.

Council Member Harkey asked if the salary was including all benefits or if it was just the base salary.

City Attorney Muñoz replied that it was the base salary calculation only.

Council Member Harkey stated that they should re-examine the whole package.

Mayor Bishop proposed approving the contract as is with the exception of the CPI and suggested that he and Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett would come back to Council at the next meeting with the recommended raise or should they continue the item.

Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett felt that they should continue the item.

Council Member Anderson stated that her motion would be to amend the contract with a salary increase of a percentage that would bring the City Manager to a median level amongst all City Managers. She asked if staff had that number.

City Manager Chotkevys replied that the survey did not include all of the City Managers in the County and comparable cities were used. He proposed a recess so Director of Administrative Services Killebrew could look at the numbers.

Council Member Weinberg stated that the City has the best employees and the City needs to pay them to keep them.

Mayor Bishop recessed the meeting at 6:42 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 6:53 p.m.

City Attorney Muñoz stated that last years increase was 7% and the year before was 6%. A 6% increase this year would take the base salary to \$201,581, a 7% increase would be \$203,042, 8% would be \$205,384, and 9% would be \$207,286.

Council Member Anderson asked what percentage would take the salary to the median. City Attorney Muñoz replied that a 9% increase would reach the median salary.

Council Member Harkey made a substitute motion to remove the CPI increase and bonus provision and go back to the regular compensation and proposed a 7% increase for this year.

This motion was seconded by Council Member Anderson.

Council Member Weinberg stated that the City Council was missing the opportunity to do something different and to incent the City Manager in a different way than in the past.

Mayor Bishop stated that the substitute motion was to accept the contract as amended minus the CPI and the bonus and provide a 7% raise.

IT WAS MOVED BY COUNCIL MEMBER HARKEY, SECONDED BY COUNCIL MEMBER ANDERSON TO APPROVE THE EIGHTH AMENDMENT TO THE EMPLOYMENT AGREEMENT FOR THE CITY MANAGER DELETING THE CPI AND BONUS INCENTIVE PROGRAM, AND PROVIDE A 7% INCREASE AND AUTHORIZE THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE THE AGREEMENT ON BEHALF OF THE CITY.

The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES: Council Members Anderson, Weinberg, Harkey, Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett and

Mayor Bishop

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None

# 10. PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT FOR SUPPLEMENTAL STRUCTURAL PLAN REVIEW SERVICES

AUTHORIZED THE CITY MANAGER TO CONTINUE THE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH WYNN ENGINEERING, INCORPORATED.

11. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION APPROVING FINAL TRACT MAP NO. 15924, THE REQUIRED LANDSCAPE AND MAINTENANCE AGREEMENT, AND THE ACCOMPANYING SUBDIVISION IMPROVEMENT AGREEMENT

Adopted Resolution 08-05-06-01 entitled:

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF DANA POINT, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING FINAL TRACT MAP NO. 15924, THE REQUIRED LANDSCAPE AND MAINTENANCE AGREEMENT, AND THE ACCOMPANYING SUBDIVISION IMPROVEMENT AGREEMENT.

12. SECOND READING AND ADOPTION OF AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF DANA POINT, CALIFORNIA ADDING ARTICLE 9 TO THE DANA POINT MUNICIPAL CODE INCLUDING SECTIONS 14.01.780 THROUGH 14.01.950, ENTITLED "CONSTRUCTION OF CABLE COMMUNICATIONS SYSTEMS"

Staff removed this item from the Consent Calendar.

City Manager Chotkevys asked that this item be deferred until the next regular City Council meeting to allow staff to review correspondence that had been received earlier in the week.

#### 13. COUNTY PROPOSITION 1B TRANSPORTATION FUNDING

AUTHORIZED THE MAYOR TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT AS REQUIRED BY OC PUBLIC WORKS TO RECEIVE \$500,000 IN PROPOSITION 1B FUNDING FROM THE COUNTY OF ORANGE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FOR THE PCH WIDENING PROJECT AT DEL OBISPO.

14. INTRODUCTION OF AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF DANA POINT, CALIFORNIA, MODIFYING CHAPTER 12.14 OF THE DANA POINT MUNICIPAL CODE ADDRESSING NECESSARY CODE REVISIONS FOR PREFERENTIAL PARKING DISTRICTS CITYWIDE

INTRODUCED FOR FIRST READING OF AN ORDINANCE ENTITLED:

AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF DANA POINT, CALIFORNIA, MODIFYING CHAPTER 12.14 OF THE DANA POINT MUNICIPAL CODE ADDRESSING NECESSARY CODE REVISIONS FOR PREFERENTIAL PARKING DISTRICTS CITYWIDE.

# 15. AUTHORIZATION TO PROCEED WITH STRIPING ADJUSTMENTS ON TWO ARTERIAL STREETS, NAMELY PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY AND DOHENY PARK ROAD, PURSUANT TO SECTION 21950 OF THE CALIFORNIA VEHICLE CODE

ACCEPTED THE DELETION/RELOCATION OF CROSSWALK IN THE EASTERLY LEG OF THE INTERSECTION AT PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY (PCH) AND DEL OBISPO/DANA POINT HARBOR DRIVE PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA VEHICLE CODE SECTION 21950 AND THE PREVIOUSLY CITY COUNCIL APPROVED PROJECT PLAN ENTITLED "PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY CONGESTION RELIEF PROJECT"; ACCEPTED THE DELETION/RELOCATION OF THE CROSSWALK FROM THE EASTERLY LEG OF THE INTERSECTION AT PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY (PCH) AND CRYSTAL LANTERN DRIVE TO THE WESTERLY LEG PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA VEHICLE CODE SECTION 21950 AND THE PREVIOUSLY CITY COUNCIL APPROVED PROJECT PLAN ENTITLED "PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY CONGESTION RELIEF PROJECT"; AND AUTHORIZED THE DELETION OF THE MID-BLOCK CROSSWALK IN THE SOUTHERLY LEG OF THE INTERSECTION AT DOHENY PARK ROAD AND DOMINGO AVENUE, WHICH OCCURRED IN 2007, PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA VEHICLE CODE SECTION 21950.

# 16. AUTHORIZATION TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS FOR THE NEXT PHASE OF CITY HALL RENOVATION

AUTHORIZED STAFF TO ADVERTISE FOR BIDS FOR THE NEXT PHASE OF CITY HALL RENOVATION.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Robert Traphagen, Dana Point, spoke regarding a lawsuit that had been filed concerning the City of Irvine regarding the Brown Act. He also spoke about the closed sessions that the Dana Point City Council has had to discuss the Makar plan. He also made reference to an article in the Dana Point Times stating Makars plan to build 150 homes.

Mayor Bishop invited Mr. Traphagen to meet with City staff to get some answers clarified.

City Manager Chotkevys added that the numbers presented by Mr. Traphagen were not provided by the developer. They were numbers that staff identified to ensure the credibility of the Negative Declaration.

Dr. James Seitz, Dana Point, spoke regarding correspondence from the City Attorney to the City Council and violations of the Brown Act.

Judy Rice, Laguna Hills and Hemet, spoke regarding the Mitigated Negative Declaration for the mobile home park property.

Ingrid McGuire, Dana Point, announced that the South Coast Water District would be having an open house at the new ground water recovery center on June 21 from 10:00 a.m. until 2:00 p.m.

Karin Schnell, Dana Point, thanked the City Council for their support of the 2<sup>nd</sup> Annual Dana Point Arts Festival. She also thanked the staff as well as Police Services for helping make the festival a success.

#### **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

There were no Public Hearings.

#### UNFINISHED BUSINESS

## 17. STORAGE OF VEHICLES ON PUBLIC STREETS

City Manager Chotkevys provided a staff report.

Council Member Weinberg stated that the Traffic Commission brought forward ideas to what they would like to see change in the code. He stated that the City should find out in few months if the problem has been solved or if we do need to modify the code. He stated that he would like to make a motion to receive and file.

Council Member Harkey stated that she was pleased that the City is using what it already has. She asked if citizens would be affected by the change in vehicle width from 90 inches to 80 inches wide and parking those vehicle on the street.

City Manager Chotkevys replied that in one particular situation, the party was now parking their work truck in their driveway.

Council Member Harkey asked if they can still store their vehicle on their driveway.

City Manager Chotkevys stated that was correct.

Council Member Harkey thanked the staff and the Council Subcommittee.

IT WAS MOVED BY COUNCIL MEMBER WEINBERG, SECONDED BY COUNCIL MEMBER HARKEY TO AUTHORIZE STAFF TO RECEIVE AND FILE THE REPORT ON THE TRAFFIC IMPROVEMENT COMMISSION'S ORDINANCE MODIFICATION RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING THE STORAGE OF VEHICLES ON PUBLIC STREETS.

The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES: Council Members Anderson, Harkey, Weinberg, Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett and

Mayor Bishop

NOES: None ABSENT: None

# 18. 2008 ABATEMENT PROGRAM, AUTHORIZATION TO ABATE WEEDS

City Manager Chotkevys provided a staff report.

IT WAS MOVED BY COUNCIL MEMBER ANDERSON, SECONDED BY COUNCIL MEMBER HARKEY, TO ADOPT **RESOLUTION 08-05-06-02** ENTITLED:

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF DANA POINT, CALIFORNIA, HEARING NO OBJECTIONS AND PROCEEDING WITH WEED ABATEMENT.

The motion carried by the following vote:

AYES: Council Members Anderson, Harkey, Weinberg, Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett, and

Mayor Bishop

NOES: None ABSENT: None

# **NEW BUSINESS**

There were no New Business items.

# **PUBLIC COMMENTS (Continued)**

There were no additional Public Comments.

# STAFF REPORTS

City Manager Chotkevys spoke regarding the increase of graffiti in the City within the last four to five months. He stated that the City is out enforcing very aggressively. He reported that a couple of youths were caught spray painting in Sunset Park over the weekend. He asked the public to call City Hall if they see graffiti within the City. He complimented Police Services, Code Enforcement, and Public Works for doing an outstanding job.

# COUNCIL REPORTS, INCLUDING CITY RELATED MEETINGS ATTENDED

Council Member Anderson reported the following:

- April 24<sup>th</sup> attended the State of the City luncheon.
- She attended the Teen Center groundbreaking ceremony for the Boys and Girls Club.
- Summer Recreation Guides are available.
- Summer programs available at the Boys and Girls Club.

Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett reported that she had attended the following:

- State of the City luncheon.
- Teen Center groundbreaking ceremony.

She also stated that the Ocean Institute has summer programs available for children.

Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett submitted other meetings that she attended and upcoming events in writing to the City Clerk (attached as Exhibit 1).

Council Member Weinberg reported that Mike Rose set up a tour for him at the San Onofre Nuclear Generating Station (SONGS).

Council Member Harkey reported the following:

- The Capistrano Valley Symphony is starting their concert series at the Mission on May 10<sup>th</sup>.
- She spoke with the City of Orange about their ordinance in regards to loitering.
- She gave a speech for the Orange County Board of Realtors on May 5<sup>th</sup>. She discussed the state budget and the economy.
- She attended the South Coast Hospital fashion show on April 25<sup>th</sup>.
- She also attended the State of the City luncheon.

Mayor Bishop read the following statement:

"The City of Dana Point will be teaming up with CR&R to host a Cleanup Day on Saturday, May 10, 2008 from 7:30 a.m. to 2:30 p.m. at Dana Hills High School and Palisades Elementary School. Bulky items such as large appliances, furniture, televisions, computers, printers, fax machines, copiers, green waste, and other large items will be accepted for FREE by the City's waste hauler CR&R. For the first time, CR&R will also collect florescent light tubes and household batteries at the event. The Goodwill Industries will also be available to accept donated items and paper shredders will be available for residents who want to shred important documents. Household Hazardous Waste such as paint, motor oil, and fertilizers will not be accepted. Over fifty percent of the items collected at these events are recycled, so do your part and bring those items that have been taking up too much space in your garage and yard. For more information, call the City at (949) 248-3571."

Mayor Bishop reported that he had attended the following:

- Boys and Girls Club Teen Center groundbreaking ceremony.
- State of the City.
- Lord of the Strings concert.
- Wag-a-thon.
- South Coast Hospital fashion show.
- Donate Life where La Plaza Center was all in purple.
- Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) orientation.
- Toured Santa Ana jail.
- Office hours.
- Dana Point Arts Festival.
- Upcoming event: June 2<sup>nd</sup>, Charity Golf Tournament.

# **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business before the City Council at this session, Mayor Bishop declared the meeting adjourned at 7:31 p.m. and announced that the next Regular Meeting of the City Council will be May 20, 2008, at 5:00 p.m. in the City Council Chamber located at 33282 Golden Lantern, Suite 210, Dana Point, California.

KATHY M. WARD CITY CLERK

APPROVED AT THE MEETING OF May 20, 2008

#### **EXHIBIT 1**

5/6/08

Council Comments from Mayor Pro Tem Bartlett:

Since our last meeting, I attended the following:

- Several TCA Board Meetings
- April 19th- Earth Day at La Plaza and attended the opening ceremony for the DP Relay for Life in Lantern Bay Park.
- April 20th- Attended the closing ceremony for DP Relay for Life
- April 24th- Attended the State of the City luncheon and also the Boys and Girls Club Teen Center Groundbreaking
- April 26th- Attended the Monarch Beach Sunrise Rotary annual children's fundraiser
- May 6<sup>th</sup>- Attended the Orange County Board of Supervisors meeting in Santa Ana
- Upcoming events:
- May 16- Ribbon cutting ceremony at Greelfield Communications on Violet Lantern- 12 Noon
- May 17<sup>th</sup> and 18th Doheny Blues Festival in DP Harbor.
- May 17<sup>th</sup>- 5<sup>th</sup> Marine Regiment Appreciation Dinner