CITY OF DANA POINT PLANNING COMMISSION AGENDA REPORT

DATE:

April 11, 2016

TO:

DANA POINT PLANNING COMMISSION

FROM:

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

URSULA LUNA-REYNOSA, DIRECTOR

LIANE SCHULLER, PLANNER

SUBJECT: A REQUEST FOR HISTORICAL RESOURCE DESIGNATION AND PARTICIPATION IN THE MILLS ACT PROGRAM AT 24711 EL CAMINO CAPISTRANO DRIVE (HISTORIC RESOURCE APPLICATION

16-0001)

RECOMMENDATION:

That the Planning Commission adopt a Resolution designating the residential structure located at 24711 El Camino Capistrano Drive as a locally significant historical structure on the Citv's Historic Register and recommend to the City Council that the City enter into an agreement with the property owner for participation in the Mills Act Program.

APPLICANT/OWNER:

Les Paup and Sally Roberts

REQUEST:

The applicants seek to have a residential structure placed on the Dana Point Historic Resource Register. The applicants also request a recommendation to enter into an agreement with the City for participation in the Mills Act Program.

LOCATION:

24711 El Camino Capistrano Drive (APN 682-202-10)

ENVIRONMENTAL:

The designation of the property on the Dana Point Historic Resource Register is not a project pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) as there is no possible effect to the environment via this designation.

BACKGROUND:

Historic Architectural Resources Inventory and Historic Resource Registry:

In 1997, the City conducted a comprehensive inventory documenting structures associated with the early development of Dana Point and establishing criteria for their designation as "locally significant". The Dana Point Historic Architectural Resources Inventory identified seventy-five structures (60 residential and 15 commercial) that met the established criteria, and which could then became candidates for historic designation.

In March 2001, the City of Dana Point Historic Resources Ordinance (Municipal Code Section 9.07.250) was enacted in an effort to preserve the City's rich history and spectacular physical location. The Ordinance established a voluntary program for property owners of qualifying structures to request inclusion on the Dana Point Historic Resources Register. Historical designation of a structure commits the property owner to preserve and maintain the historical attributes of the structure in exchange for development standard flexibility and financial incentives.

The Ordinance establishes the following Program Eligibility Criteria to be used to identify qualifying structures, and states that qualifying structures must be fifty (50) years or older and achieve a minimum of two of the following criteria:

- (A) <u>Buildings, structures, or places that are important key focal or pivotal points in the visual quality or character of an area, neighborhood, or survey district.</u>
- (B) <u>Structures that help retain the characteristics of the town that was 50 years ago.</u>
- (C) Structures that contribute to the unique urban quality of a downtown.
- (D) Structures contributing to the architectural continuity of the street.
- (E) <u>Structures that are identified with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the culture and/or development of the city, state, or nation.</u>
- (F) Structures that represent an architectural type or period and/or represent the design work of known architects, draftsmen, or builders whose efforts have significantly influenced the heritage of the city, state, or nation.
- (G) Structures that illustrate the development of California locally and regionally.
- (H) Buildings retaining the original integrity of and/or illustrating a given period.
- (I) Structures unique in design or detail, such as, but not limited to, materials, windows, landscaping, plaster finishes, and architectural innovation.
- (J) <u>Structures that are at least 50 years old or properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years if they are of exceptional importance.</u>

Since the adoption of the City's Historic Ordinance, 40 structures have been placed on the Historic Resources Register and 31 of those are participating in the Mills Act Program.

Mills Act:

The California State Office of Historic Preservation has authorized cities to enter into contracts with property owners to protect and maintain historic structures. A Mills Act Contract allows the owners of qualifying historic structures to pay reduced property taxes, thereby freeing up funds to maintain, preserve and/or restore their property. A structure must be placed on the local Historic Register in order to qualify for a Mills Act Contract. Such contracts have a minimum ten-year term, and require that the property owners

maintain and/or restore the property such that the historic features of the qualifying property are preserved.

DISCUSSION:

The subject property is approximately 9,450 square feet in area (.22 acre) and is located within the Dana Point Specific Plan. The General Plan designation for the site is low- to medium density single-family residential (3.5-7.0 units/acre).

The residential structure is one of the original Sidney Woodruff houses. Built in 1928, it was one of several designed by architect Charles Hunter in the Provincial Revival style, as opposed to the Spanish Colonial Revival style which is more characteristic of Woodruff development. The structure meets Criteria (A), (B), (E), (F), and (J) of the City's Historic Resources Ordinance. These criteria are <u>underlined</u> in the list provided above and discussed in greater detail below.

Viewing the property from the street, the structure features a rectangular, two-story design on the left side with an attached one-story wing on the right. An arch-covered carriage drive passes between these two portions of the structure, leading to a formal English garden and detached two-car garage at the rear of the property. The Provincial Revival architectural style features a steeply pitched wood shingle roof, half timbering, stucco and brick exterior, a stucco and random weave brick chimney, and wood casement windows. It appears that the two-story entry area which projects from the center of the structure may have been altered or may have been an addition to the original structure. The house is in excellent condition.

As previously stated, the subject property qualifies as a historic resource in that it is at least 50 years of age and it meets Criteria (A), (B), (E), (F) and (J) in accordance with the Historic Resources Ordinance. Each Criterion as it relates to the existing structure is discussed below:

(A) Buildings, structures, or places that are important key focal or pivotal points in the visual quality or character of an area, neighborhood, or survey district.

Many of the historic Woodruff homes are concentrated in the City's Lantern District and the preservation of this home contributes to the historic character of this neighborhood. The street on which the subject home is located contains several other Woodruff homes and still features the original street lanterns and historic stamped sidewalk panels.

(B) Structures that help retain the characteristics of the town that was 50 years ago.

This home is representative of a number of residential and commercial structures built in the Capistrano Beach and Dana Point coastal area in the mid- to late-1920's and early-1930's by Prohibition-era tycoons including Sidney Woodruff,

Edward Doheny and Ole Hanson. At that time, the area was touted as a "coastal get-away" from the busyness of Los Angeles and the hubbub of Hollywood.

(E) Structures that are identified with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the culture and/or development of the city, state, or nation.

In mid-1926, Los Angeles realtor-builder S.H. (Sidney) Woodruff formed a group of investors as a means to finance the purchase, subdivision, and development of roughly 1,400 acres of coastal property in what is now the City of Dana Point. As the head of this group - known as the Dana Point Syndicate - Woodruff was instrumental in designing the Dana Point development and promoting its coastal amenities through a nationwide publicity campaign.

Early residents of this particular home were the Holliday family. Mr. Holliday was the managing editor of the Los Angeles Herald newspaper`.

(F) Structures that represent an architectural type or period and/or represent the design work of known architects, draftsmen, or builders whose efforts have significantly influenced the heritage of the city, state, or nation.

This home is an exceptional example of the Provincial Revival architectural style that Sidney Woodruff used in the development of his "Mediterranean" village, which included a mix of Spanish, English and Italian styles.

(J) Structures that are at least 50 years old or properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years if they are of exceptional importance.

This 1928 residential structure is 88 years old and was built during a period of significance in the development of Dana Point.

CONCLUSION:

The residential structure at 24711 El Camino Capistrano is included on the City's Historic Architectural Resources Inventory and satisfies five (5) of the eligibility criteria set forth by the Historic Resources Ordinance, clearly demonstrating that the home is eligible for inclusion on the Dana Point Historic Resources Register. The preservation of the historical attributes and the character-defining features of the home are supported by the owners. With designation of this structure, a total of forty-one (41) structures would be on the Dana Point Historic Resource Register. The property owners also seek to participate in the Mills Act Program which requires the City Council's authorization to enter into an agreement.

Staff recommends the Planning Commission: (1) adopt the attached draft resolution placing the structure located at 24711 El Camino Capistrano on the Dana Point Historic Resources Register, and (2) forward a recommendation to the City Council to authorize an agreement for participation in the Mills Act Program.

Liane Schuller

Project Planner

Ursula Luna-Reynosa, Director of Community Development

ACTION DOCUMENT:

1. Resolution No.16-04-11-xx

ATTACHMENTS:

- 2. Vicinity Map
- 3. Historic Inventory Record
- 4. Photograph: Front of House
- 5. Photograph: Back of House
- 6. Photograph: Detached Garage

RESOLUTION NO. 16-04-11-xx

A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF DANA POINT, CALIFORNIA, DESIGNATING A RESIDENCE AS A HISTORIC RESOURCE, PLACING THAT STRUCTURE ON THE DANA POINT HISTORIC RESOURCES REGISTER (HRA16-0001) AND RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL ENTER INTO A MILLS ACT AGREEMENT FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 24711 EL CAMINO CAPISTRANO DRIVE.

The Planning Commission for the City of Dana Point does hereby resolve as follows:

WHEREAS, Les Paup and Sally Roberts (collectively, the "Applicant") own the real property located at

24711 El Camino Capistrano Drive (A.P.N. 682-202-10) (the "Property"); and

WHEREAS, the Applicant has filed a Historic Resource Application to request designation of a residential building as a historic resource and placement of that structure on the Dana Point Historic Resource Register; and

WHEREAS, the City of Dana Point has an adopted a Historic Resource Ordinance (the "Ordinance") which establishes a voluntary program for the preservation of qualifying structures; and

WHEREAS, the subject property is governed under the Dana Point Zoning Code, which contains provisions related to designating historic structures; and

WHEREAS, the subject property satisfies the Program Eligibility Criteria established by the Ordinance for including structures on the Dana Point Historic Resources Register and for participation in the Mills Act Program; and

WHEREAS, the applicant understands the required commitment to keep the subject property in good repair as detailed in the Ordinance; and

WHEREAS, in exchange for preservation of the historic structure, the property owner becomes eligible for incentives described in the Ordinance.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT HEREBY RESOLVED by the Planning Commission of the City of Dana Point as follows:

- A) That the above recitations are true and correct.
- B) That based on the evidence presented at the public meeting, the Commission adopts the following findings and approves Historic Resource Application HRA16-0001.
- C) That the Planning Commission recommends that the City Council

enter into an agreement with the property owner for the Mills Act Program.

Findings:

- 1. That the proposed Historical Resource Application complies with all other applicable requirements of State law and local ordinances.
- 2. That the designation of the property on the Dana Point Historic Resource Register is not a project pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) as there is no possible effect to the environment via this designation.
- 3. That the Historical Resource Application is consistent with the goals and policies of the General Plan and Zoning Code and the project meets the findings necessary for the approval of the request to include the subject property on the Dana Point Historic Resources Register.
- 4. That the Dana Point Historic Resource Ordinance identifies Program Eligibility Criteria for designating historic resources. Qualifying properties must be 50 years or older and satisfy a minimum of two Criteria. The subject property satisfies five (5) of the ten Criteria established in the Ordinance, as discussed below:
 - (A) Buildings, structures, or places that are important key focal or pivotal points in the visual quality or character of an area, neighborhood, or survey district.

Many of the historic Woodruff homes are concentrated in Lantern District area of the City and the preservation of this home contributes to the historic character of this neighborhood. The street on which the subject home is located contains several other Woodruff homes and still features the original street lanterns and historic stamped sidewalk panels.

(B) Structures that help retain the characteristics of the town that was 50 years ago.

This home is representative of a number of residential and commercial structures built in the Capistrano Beach and Dana Point coastal area in the mid- to late-1920's and early-1930's by Prohibition-era tycoons including Sidney Woodruff, Edward Doheny and Ole Hanson. At that time, the area was touted as a "coastal get-away" from the busyness of Los Angeles and the hubbub of Hollywood.

(E) Structures that are identified with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the culture and/or development of the city, state, or nation.

In mid-1926, Los Angeles realtor-builder S.H. (Sidney) Woodruff formed a group of investors as a means to finance the purchase, subdivision, and development of roughly 1,400 acres of coastal property in what is now the City of Dana Point. As the head of this group - known as the Dana Point Syndicate - Woodruff was instrumental in designing the Dana Point development and promoting its coastal amenities through a nationwide publicity campaign.

Early residents of this particular home were the Holliday family. Mr. Holliday was the managing editor of the Los Angeles Herald newspaper.

(F) Structures that represent an architectural type or period and/or represent the design work of known architects, draftsmen, or builders whose efforts have significantly influenced the heritage of the city, state, or nation.

This home is an exceptional example of the Provincial Revival architectural style that Sidney Woodruff used in the development of his "Mediterranean" village, which included a mix of Spanish, English and Italian styles.

(J) Structures that are at least 50 years old or properties that have achieved significance within the past 50 years if they are of exceptional importance.

This 1928 residential structure is 88 years old and was built during a period of significance in the development of Dana Point.



PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO	. 16-04-11-xx
HRA16-0001	
PAGE 4	

PASSED, APPROVED, AND ADOPTED at a regular meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of Dana Point, California, held on this 11th day of April, 2016, by the following vote, to wit:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

April O'Connor, Chairperson Planning Commission

ATTEST:

Ursula Luna-Reynosa, Director Community Development Department



VICINITY MAP



Project: Historic Resource Application HRA 16-0001

Applicants: Les Paup and Sally Roberts Location: 24711 El Camino Capistrano



Supporting Document #3

Primary # State of California -- The Resources Agency DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION HRI # PRIMARY RECORD Trinomial NRHP Status Code Other Listings Date Review Code Reviewer 24711 El Camino Capistrano *Resource Name or #: P1. Other Identifier: *P2. Location: Not for Publication **⊠** Unrestricted a. County Orange b. USGS 7.5' Quad T ____; R ___; ___1/4 of __1/4 of Sec __; __ c. Address 24711 El Camino Capistrano City Dana Point d. UTM: (Give more than one for large and/or linear feature) Zone _____ e. Other Locational Data: (e.g. parcel #, legal description, directions to resource, elevation, additional UTMs, etc. as appropriate) Assessor's Parcel Number: 682-202-10 *P3a. Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries.) This Provincial Revival structure has a rectangular, two-story section and a one-story wing to the right. Features of the style include: a steeply pitched, wood shingle roof; half timbering; stucco and brick walls; a stucco and random weave brick chimney; and wood casement windows. An archway on the right side leads to a formal English garden. An intersecting, two-story, uneven pitch gable projection in the center front forms the entry. This section has been altered from the original or may be an addition. Behind the house is a detached garage with a cupola and weathervane. The house is in excellent condition. *P3b. Resources Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP2. Single Family Property Resources Present: M Building □ Structure □ Object □Site ☐ District ☐ Element of District ☐ Other (Isolates, etc.) P5b. Description of Photo: (View, date, etc.) *P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources: ☐ Prehistoric ☐ Historic ☐ Both 1928 F P7. Owner and Address: David W. Brown, Tr 2164 E. Broadway Rd. S 300 Tempe, AZ 85282 -P--Private P8. Recorded by:(Name, affiliation, address) Judy Wright & Mary Stoddard **AEGIS** 112 Harvard Ave. S 93 Claremont, CA 91711 P9. Date Recorded: 05/23/1997 P10. Survey Type: (Describe) C--Comprehensive Survey P11. Report Citation: (Cite survey report/other sources or "none") County Survey March 1981 Attachments: NONE ☐ Location Map Sketch Map □ Continuation Sheet Building, Structure and Object Record □ District Record □ Linear Feature Record □ Milling Station Record □ Rock Art Record □ Artifact Record ☐ Archaeological Record ☐ Photograph Record ☐ Other: (List)

Sta	ate of California The Resources Agency PARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION		mary #
	UILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJE	HR CT DE CC	#
			
*Res	c <u>2</u> of <u>2</u> source Name or #: <u>24711 El Camino</u> Capistrano	*NI	RHP Status Code <u>5S2</u>
B1.	mm =	<u>-</u>	
B2.			
83. 85.	Original Use: Residence Architectural Style: Provincial Revival	B4. Presen	t Use: R-Residential SF
	Construction History: (Construction date, alterations, and	date of alterati	ions.)
	1928 F Construction		Alts: Front entry (1996)
	e e		
B7.	Moved? ⊠No □Yes □Unknown Date:	Original Loc	eation:
38.			
	Architect: Charles A. Hunter	_ b. Builder:	Western Construction Co.
10.	Period of Significance 1928-1931 Property To	una Decidani	_ Area _ <u>Dana Point</u>
	(Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context a	ype <u>ICSIUCN</u> as defined by the	CE Applicable Criteria NA
	This house is one of the original Woodruff house		
	instead of the usual Spanish Colonial Revival sty family. Mr. Holliday was Managing Editor of the	le of the dev	velopment. An early resident was the Holliday
	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
	a representative example of the architecture during	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
i.e.	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
tu Na	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
tur Nati	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
t us Sust	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
te ez	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
tu kur	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for
tu sur	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should that may be developed. (See Appendix III).	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for red eligible for listing under any local ordinan
	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should that may be developed. (See Appendix III). Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes)	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for red eligible for listing under any local ordinan
	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should that may be developed. (See Appendix III). Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References:	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for red eligible for listing under any local ordinan
	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should that may be developed. (See Appendix III). Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes)	ig the period	d of significance. Although not eligible for red eligible for listing under any local ordinan
12.	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should that may be developed. (See Appendix III). Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for red eligible for listing under any local ordinan
12.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for red eligible for listing under any local ordinan
12.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III)	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant le Family Property
12.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant le Family Property
12.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III)	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant le Family Property
12.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant le Family Property
12.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant le Family Property
13.	a representative example of the architecture during separate listing in the National Register, it should that may be developed. (See Appendix III). Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks: Threats: Unknown	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant left. Santa Clara
12. 13.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks: Threats: Unknown Evaluator: Judy Wright & Mary Stoddard	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant left. Santa Clara
12.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks: Threats: Unknown Evaluator: Judy Wright & Mary Stoddard Date of Evaluation:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant le Family Property
13.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks: Threats: Unknown Evaluator: Judy Wright & Mary Stoddard Date of Evaluation:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant left. Santa Clara
13.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks: Threats: Unknown Evaluator: Judy Wright & Mary Stoddard Date of Evaluation:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant left. Santa Clara
13.	Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) References: Orange Assessor's Records County Survey March 1981/Environmental Coalid (See Appendix III) Remarks: Threats: Unknown Evaluator: Judy Wright & Mary Stoddard Date of Evaluation:	g the period be conside	d of significance. Although not eligible for cred eligible for listing under any local ordinant left. Santa Clara





